### RIMIRIF

BARRISTERS SOLICITORS

Reynolds Mirth Richards & Farmer LLP

# VIRTUAL HEARING GUIDE FOR PROFESSIONAL REGULATORY ORGANIZATIONS

Copyright RMRF LLP 2020. All rights reserved.





**D8** PRELIMINARY CONFERENCE



- Appendix A Procedural outline for virtual consent hearing
- Appendix B Procedural outline for virtual contested hearing
- Appendix C Procedural outline for virtual sanction hearing
- Appendix D Chair instruction for witnesses
- Appendix E Tips for witnesses
- Appendix F Chart comparing in-person hearings to virtual hearings
- Appendix G Undertaking of regulated member of the profession attending the hearing
- Appendix H Undertaking of members of the public attending the hearing



This guide is meant to assist the organizers and participants of virtual administrative proceedings. Although the creation of this guide was prompted in part by COVID-19, we expect an increased number of administrative hearings will proceed virtually in the future.

Virtual hearings have many advantages: they can be more cost effective for the organizers and the participants, they can allow broader access and participation, they can proceed more efficiently, they can reduce resource needs, and they can be convened anywhere with internet access.

Virtual hearings also have disadvantages: there are accessibility concerns, additional steps may be required to ensure procedural fairness of the hearing, and there are logistical hurdles.

The purpose of this guide is to facilitate virtual hearings by providing a resource with information on common questions and concerns. The body of the guide is geared toward those organizing virtual hearings, and there are a number of resources provided in the appendices that can be shared with virtual hearing participants, including Hearing Tribunal members, counsel, and witnesses.

This guide is intended to be used as a general resource. If you or your organization encounters any particular dilemmas not addressed here, we encourage you to contact our firm directly for further consultation and advice.

# CHOOSING YOUR PLATFORM

The Professional Regulatory Organization ("PRO" or "College") holding the hearing generally organizes the hearing logistics such as location, court reporter, and sending out notices, and undertakes other administrative tasks inherent in organizing a hearing. The College typically has a hearing administrator who organizes and prepares the administrative elements of the hearing. In the virtual world, the hearing administrator for the College should choose the virtual platform for hosting the hearing. The *procedure* of the Things you might want to consider when selecting your platform:

- Who will be the facilitator during the hearing?
- How many hearing participants will you have?
- If the hearing must be public, how will the public get access? What will that access entail?
- Will hearing participants require "break-out rooms"?
- Will document sharing programs be required? If so, how many documents are likely to be shared and is an

hearing will be set by the Hearing Tribunal.

Each hearing administrator will want to choose the best platform for its College's needs. There are many existing platforms that provide a variety of different options for virtual hearings. If you require a court reporter for your virtual hearing, you may wish to speak to a representative from the company about what options they have available, and which platform will best suit your needs.

There should be a facilitator present during the hearing to assist with the logistics of the hearing, including allowing participants into the meeting, moving participants into breakout rooms as needed, and assisting with trouble shooting. The facilitator can be a member of the College's staff (such as the Hearings Director), the Hearing Tribunal Chair, independent legal counsel, or, in some cases, the court reporter. The facilitator will need to be familiar with the virtual platform being used.

Current virtual platform options include: Zoom, Webex, Microsoft Teams, Lifesize, Bluejeans, Google Meet, and additional program necessary to facilitate this?

Make sure each participant in the virtual hearing has access to the platform you choose. Each participant must also have:

- A quiet, private place to connect from;
- Reliable and strong internet access; and
- A camera, microphone and speakers on their computer.

You might also recommend that each participant have:

- A headset;
- An extra monitor to view documents on.

Virtual hearing participants should share their cell phone numbers and email addresses with the facilitator and be provided with the facilitator's contact information prior to the hearing so that any technical issues or disruptions can be addressed efficiently during the hearing.

Hearing administrators should provide the meeting password shortly before the meeting start time and ask participants not to share it with anyone. Recommended security features include using 2-factor authentication and strong passwords.

#### GoToMeeting.

Participants will need to download the virtual platform, but do not need an account to join the hearing.

#### The virtual platform should, at a minimum:

- provide protections for confidentiality;
- provide high resolution video imaging and quality audio;
- enable smaller groups (e.g. counsel and client, the Hearing Tribunal, etc.) to meet by themselves during the proceeding (sometimes called caucusing or "breakout rooms"); and
- enable documents and other participants to be displayed on the screen at the same time (sometimes called a "share screen" feature).

Hearing administrators should use host security features such as:

- locking the meeting;
- enabling a "waiting room"; and
- limiting participants' ability to share screens, "chat" or rename themselves.

The Hearing Administrator Chooses the Platform The Hearing Tribunal Determines the Procedure

TIP

# TRAINING/ ORIENTATION

In advance of any virtual hearing, you should expect that participants will need an introduction to the process. While some aspects of a virtual hearing are very similar to an in-person hearing, others can be quite different.

The College should have orientation available for the Hearing Tribunal members and independent legal counsel. The orientation can be simple and straightforward. It should include information such as:

- who will facilitate the hearing;
- which platform your organization uses;
- when and how to connect;
- basic troubleshooting; and
- the expected procedure.

The Hearing Tribunal members should be provided the opportunity to experience the platform prior to the hearing. A "test" meeting with the Hearing Tribunal prior to the hearing is a great way to make people feel more comfortable. It may also be beneficial to hold a "test" meeting with all participants. This could be done in advance of the hearing or 30 minutes before the hearing start time on the day of the hearing.

Counsel for parties in virtual hearings are expected to ensure that their clients and witnesses have received their own orientation in the expected procedure.

#### TIP

Prevent Fear of the Unknown: Participants should Practice with the Platform until they are Comfortable

# tips for your set-up

**1.** Make sure you have a working camera, microphone and speakers in advance of the hearing. If you are using a laptop or tablet device, it likely has these built in. If you are using a desk-top computer, you may need to acquire a camera, microphone, and speakers to be able to participate.

**2.** It is best to have an extra monitor to view documents. Any additional screen connected to your computer should work, including a television or laptop.

TIP: Make sure you can be seen and heard by everyone, and make sure you can see and hear all the participants. **3.** Clear your calendar for the duration of the time you are expecting to participate in a hearing. If you have children, pets, or other distractions that may interrupt, do your best to make sure their needs are met by others during the time you are expected to attend the hearing.

**4.** Make sure you have a quiet, private space that will be available for the duration of your participation in the hearing.

**5.** Make sure your internet connection is stable and minimize other usage for the duration of your participation in the hearing. Wifi will work, but hardwired internet connections are better. Close any programs unrelated to the hearing which can slow down the connection.

**6.** You may wish to use headphones connected to your computer to block external noise and help focus your attention on the hearing.

7. You will need to download the virtual platform, but you do

not need an account in order to participate.

**8.** Be prepared to join the hearing about half an hour before it is scheduled to begin, in case there are any technical difficulties.

**9.** When participating in a hearing, face the camera with your full face in the screen. Try to make sure you do not to turn away from the camera.

**10.** Try to position yourself with a blank wall with no distractions behind you, and no bright lights (e.g. windows) either in front of you or behind you.

**11.** Wear appropriate clothing. You might be at home, but the participants can still see you.

# TIPS FOR THE HEARING

Make sure the facilitator has a master list of everyone's contact information (name, cell phone number, email) including the the court reporter, in case of technical problems.

Make sure there is a protocol in place to deal with technical problems (e.g. all parties stop until everyone is reconnected).

Before the hearing begins, make sure everyone can hear and see each other.

As participants join the meeting, they will likely need to be admitted to the hearing, and a password may be required to enter. Ensure all participants are aware of the protocol.

All participants should silence their cellphones and any other communicating devices for the duration of the hearing.

All participants should "mute" their microphone unless they are speaking. Background noises, typing, shuffling papers, or other sounds will distract from the hearing.

Be prepared for glitches, and establish a protocol for what will happen if

someone is "kicked out" of the platform.

Consider scheduling your hearing for longer than you would an in-person hearing. Using a virtual setting, especially if it is new to some or all of the participants, can mean extra time is required.

Consider scheduling periodic 10 to 15-minute breaks to give participants a rest; focusing on a screen for long periods of time can be visually draining.

TIP Remind All Participants to Speak Slowly and One at a Time

# SECURITY/ PRIVACY

#### **Open Hearings**

Most professional discipline hearings are open to the public, unless an application is made to hold the hearing in private. If a virtual hearing is to be open to the public, the hearing will need to be publicized in advance in the usual fashion, including information on who to contact in order to attend the

#### <u>All Hearings</u>

To prevent unwanted parties entering the hearing without consent, it is advisable for the hearing administrator to set a password to enter the meeting.

The hearing administrator should also disable individual

virtual hearing.

If a member of the public wishes to attend the hearing, they should have contact information of who to contact to receive a link to view the hearing. This is preferable to posting a link to the hearing platform directly on the College's website. In addition, the hearings administrator should consider the settings in the platform for members of the public attending the hearing. Some virtual hearing platforms allow participants to watch and listen only, but they cannot be seen or heard and cannot participate in any other fashion. The College can also have a "viewing room" available at the College office where the hearing is displayed on a screen, in the event a member of the public attends to view the hearing.

The College will need to consider protocols to ensure public access to the hearing, while ensuring that hearings are not recorded by any participants or members of the public. Ensuring all participants are aware of and agree to the prohibition on recording the hearing at the start of a hearing is a good practice. Colleges could also require participants to sign an undertaking that they will not record or rebroadcast any part of the hearing (see Appendix G and Appendix H for template undertakings). "chats" so that no-one can "chat" with another participant without all parties being aware of it. The meeting should be locked, the hearing administrator can enable a "waiting room", and participants' ability to share screens or rename themselves should be limited.

## **NEVER SHARE MEETING LINKS PUBLICLY**

#### **Closed Hearings**

If a hearing or part of a hearing is held in private, the virtual platform should have security settings to prevent anyone without permission from entering the hearing and participating in any way.

The facilitator should ensure that they are able to stop and restart public access (either online as part of the platform or in the College's office in person) should the hearing need to be closed in full or in part.

# PRINCIPLES OF NATURAL JUSTICE

The principles of natural justice must remain at the forefront of any administrative proceeding. At their most basic, this means that anyone subject to an administrative proceeding has:

TIP: Whether

- **1.** The right to know the case against them;
- **2.** The right to be heard;
- **3.** The right to an impartial and unbiased decision maker;
- 4. The right to a decision made by those who heard the case; and
- **5.** The right to a decision with reasons.

Ensuring that these principles remain in place in a virtual hearing is of vital importance. All Hearing Tribunal members should be reminded of these fundamental principles and be alive to their role in making sure they are met, even in a virtual context.

There should be minimal change to the process of the hearing itself. The platform is new, but the same principles apply. If the Hearing Tribunal needs to caucus, ask questions of independent legal counsel, or take time to review the evidence, these options are still available and break-out rooms or a separate conference call line can be used.

There is some evidence that hearing evidence virtually, versus in-person, can impact the apparent authenticity and credibility of a witness. The Hearing Tribunal should be informed of this potential bias to ensure they are aware of the issue.

virtually or in-person,
the investigated
person has the same
rights and will
experience the same
impact

071 Principles of Natural Justice

Copyright RMRF LLP 2020. All rights reserved.

# Preliminary conference

Consider whether it is necessary to have a preliminary conference to decide how to manage procedural issues in advance of the hearing. For example, participants may wish to sort out the best way to share documents, whether documents should be password protected and shared in advance, how and who will number exhibits, etc. Some of these questions are addressed in the next section.



The College should provide participants with the opportunity to present motions or joint proposals to the Hearing Tribunal, who ultimately will decide its own process.

A preliminary conference can avoid a hearing that is convened and then adjourned because procedural issues need to be addressed before proceeding with the substance of the hearing.



#### TIP

Iron out the procedural wrinkles prior to the hearing

# DEALING WITH DOCUMENTS

Parties should turn their minds to how they wish to deal with any documents to be tendered at a virtual hearing. Some options include:

- i. An agreed exhibit book (PDF with page numbers), distributed in advance with undertakings by the Hearing Tribunal members not to look at it or send any part of it to anyone. The PDF can be password protected and the password only distributed once the particular party should have access;
- ii. A screen share for exhibits to show to a witness; or
- iii. Use of a secure program such as ShareFile or Sync to share documents as the hearing progresses.

Other considerations:

- i. <u>Documents a party wishes to tender as an exhibit</u>: There might be documents which have been excluded from the agreed exhibit book, but which a party plans to tender as an exhibit. To avoid any surprises, parties could share their documents with the other lawyer or investigated person (if unrepresented) in advance of the hearing. This will allow a smoother process because all parties will be able to speak to the document without the need to adjourn the hearing. Another option is for the document to be exchanged between counsel via email during the hearing so that both parties can make submissions on whether it should be entered as an exhibit.
- ii. <u>How to enter exhibits</u>: Some options available are:
  - a. the court reporter can mark the exhibits electronically; or
  - b. for Colleges where the Chair marks the exhibit, the Chair can print the first page of each exhibit, mark it, and then send the marked exhibit pages to the hearing administrator after the hearing.
- <sup>iii.</sup> <u>Document disposal</u>: Hearing Tribunal members (and anyone else receiving materials) must ensure secure disposal of documents after a hearing. Options include secure shredding if a document has been printed or returning all materials to the hearing administrator after the written decision has been issued. Documents received electronically should be permanently deleted from the Hearing Tribunal member's computer or device after the written decision has been issued.
- <sup>iv.</sup> <u>Physical evidence</u>: Consider if physical evidence will be an issue in the hearing. Unless a process is agreed to in advance of the hearing for the entry of this evidence, this type of evidence can be challenging to deal with in a virtual hearing.

Ultimately, the Hearing Tribunal is the master of its own procedure. If the parties cannot come to a consensus on how to deal with documents, the Hearing Tribunal may need to make a ruling on the procedural component of how to deal with disputed documents.

For parties tendering evidence, consider having one person handle the questioning, while an assistant or co-counsel manages the documents and any necessary note-taking.



## WITNESSES

Witnesses in administrative hearings are required to take an oath that they will tell the truth. There are typically two ways to do this: the witness may affirm, or they may swear on a religious text. In a virtual hearing, the simpler procedure is to have the witness affirm. However, if a witness wishes to swear on a religious text in a virtual hearing, the witness must provide their own religious text.

The College will also need to consider whether there is a need for interpreters or any considerations that may be needed for special needs participants. These issues should be addressed well in advance of the hearing.

If there is a concern with witness conduct during the hearing (i.e. appearing to be taking cues, reading from an unknown

Counsel for the participants (or participants themselves, if self-represented), should be responsible for making sure that witnesses have:

- The required technology;
- Contact information for counsel, who will notify them when to call in and how they will be admitted to the hearing; and
- The materials they require in order to participate (including a religious text to swear on, if necessary).

Make sure the witness is only able to open and view the required documentation when asked to do so during the hearing (see comments above about document sharing and password protecting documents).

There is some evidence that hearing evidence virtually, versus in-person, can impact the apparent authenticity and credibility of a witness. One way to combat this is to ensure the witness is in good lighting, easy to see and easy to hear. In addition, it may be wise to have a witness show the room in which they are testifying before they give their evidence, to show that they do not have additional notes or individuals providing them with evidence or coaching. Having the witness' camera pulled back, so that a broader view is allowed which includes their upper body and the table in front of them, can make it easier for a Hearing Tribunal to evaluate a witness's evidence. document, or consulting with someone off-screen), it should be addressed by the Hearing Tribunal as soon as it is noticed so that the witness can have an opportunity to explain the conduct. This is preferable to having the witness' evidence tainted by the suspicion of coaching.

Counsel or a self-represented party is responsible for preparing the witness

The Hearing Tribunal is responsible for hearing and understanding the evidence without bias

The Hearing Tribunal should be aware of these issues, as with any other bias issues. Hearing Tribunals may benefit from training in assessing witness credibility and understanding and addressing bias.

Appendix E includes tips for witnesses participating in virtual hearings and what they can expect.

# Conclusion

This guide was created to help Colleges organize and run virtual hearings. Virtual hearings have become a necessity due to the COVID-19 pandemic. However, learning how to have virtual hearings will continue to have benefits. This guide is the start of the learning process, but practice and experience are extremely important.

Attached to this guide are a number of appendices with tips and suggestions for the procedure of a virtual hearing. These are excellent resources to have with you during a virtual hearing.



We hope you will find this guide helpful, but if any dilemmas or problems arise that are not addressed here, we

encourage you to contact our firm directly for further consultation and advice.

### **APPENDIX A Procedural outline for virtual consent hearing**

#### **PROCEDURE OUTLINE FOR HEARING TRIBUNAL CHAIR** FOR A HEARING PROCEEDING BY AGREED STATEMENT OF FACTS AND ADMISSION OF **UNPROFESSIONAL CONDUCT**

#### AT THE COMMENCEMENT OF THE HEARING

1. Facilitator/Chair to:

- a. Make sure all participants are present;
- b. Make sure everyone can hear and see the proceedings;
- c. Ask all participants to mute their microphone when not speaking;
- d. Clarify that recording or rebroadcasting of the hearing is not permitted;
- e. Advise counsel that if they are referring to documents, they must ensure they refer the Hearing Tribunal to the correct document and page number; and
- f. Outline the procedure if the Hearing Tribunal members need to deliberate or if counsel and their client need a break to discuss an issue.

#### 2. Chair opens the hearing:

"This is a hearing of the Hearing Tribunal appointed under the [Act] to consider allegations of unprofessional conduct against [name of investigated person]"

3. Chair introduces everyone:

"I would ask all the parties present to introduce themselves for the record:

- I am [state name], Chair of the Hearing Tribunal ... "

[Chair to do a roll call of all participants and have them identify themselves and their roles]

4. Chair confirms no objections to the Hearing Tribunal or its jurisdiction:

"Are there any objections to the Hearing Tribunal members who will be hearing this case or the Hearing Tribunal's jurisdiction?"

[Both parties to confirm no objection or if objection, hear from both parties and then adjourn to decide if necessary]

5. Chair confirms entitlement to counsel (only required if the investigated person is unrepresented):

"[Name of investigated person], do you acknowledge that you have the right to be represented by legal counsel and have chosen to waive your right to have legal counsel present today."

6. Confirming the open hearing:

"The hearing is open to the public unless the Hearing Tribunal decides to hold the hearing or a part of the hearing in private pursuant to *[cite section of Act].* Are there any applications to hold the hearing or a part of the hearing in private?"

[If so, hear submissions from both parties and then adjourn to decide if necessary]

7. Entering the Notice of Hearing:

"I would ask [prosecuting counsel] to enter the Notice of Hearing."

[Chair can read the Allegation(s) into the record or allow time for the Hearing Tribunal members to review the Allegation(s)]

8. Preliminary matters:

"Are there any other preliminary matters or jurisdictional issues that need to be addressed?"

[If so, hear submissions from both parties and then adjourn to decide if necessary]

#### 9. Prosecuting counsel's submissions:

"We understand the parties are proceeding by way of Agreed Statement of Facts and Admission of Unprofessional Conduct. I would ask *[prosecuting counsel]* to proceed with your submissions."

10. Counsel for the investigated person's submissions (or Investigated person's submissions, if unrepresented):

"[Counsel for investigated person or investigated person] please proceed with your submissions."

11. Reply submissions:

"[Prosecuting counsel] do you have any reply submissions."

12. Following all submissions:

"The Hearing Tribunal will adjourn to review the exhibits and consider the submissions and admission by the investigated person and determine if it has any questions of the parties."

#### <u>OR</u>

"The Hearing Tribunal will now adjourn to a separate break-out room [or separate conference call] to discuss whether there are any questions and to deliberate. Please remain in the virtual hearing but pause your video and sound. The facilitator will email/text you to advise when the Hearing Tribunal is coming back in the plenary hearing room and then all parties should reconvene in the plenary hearing room."

13. If there are any questions for the parties, the Chair reconvenes the hearing and the Hearing Tribunal members ask any questions. The Hearing Tribunal can adjourn again to deliberate if needed.

#### **II. FOLLOWING CONSIDERATION OF THE AGREEMENT AND ADMISSION**

14. Following questions by the Hearing Tribunal, if any and deliberations:

[If the Hearing Tribunal finds the allegation(s) proven and the conduct to be unprofessional]

"The Hearing Tribunal has considered the agreement and attachments, the admission of the investigated person and the submissions of the parties. The Hearing Tribunal finds that the allegation(s) has (have) been proven and that the conduct of the investigated person constitutes unprofessional conduct."

[If the Hearing Tribunal does not find the allegations proven or the conduct to be unprofessional, the process and next steps should be discussed with independent legal counsel.]

15. Submissions on sanction:

"The Hearing Tribunal is now prepared to hear submissions from the parties on sanction."

16. The Hearing Tribunal hears submissions from both counsel in the same manner as set out above, adjourns to deliberate and determine if there are any questions of the parties. If so, the hearing is reconvened and the Hearing Tribunal asks any questions.

#### **III. AT THE CONCLUSION OF THE HEARING**

17. Following submissions by the parties and questions by the Hearing Tribunal:

[If the Hearing Tribunal has reached a decision to accept a sanction agreement – can advise verbally with a written decision to follow:]

"The Hearing Tribunal has considered the proposed sanction and the submissions by the parties. The Hearing Tribunal finds the proposed sanction to be reasonable and accepts the proposed sanction. The Hearing Tribunal will issue a written decision with reasons in due course. The hearing is now adjourned."

#### <u>OR</u>

[If Hearing Tribunal is considering varying the sanction <u>after</u> allowing the parties to make submissions on any concerns/questions that the Hearing Tribunal has].

"The Hearing Tribunal will now adjourn in-camera to consider the materials and the submissions made by the parties. A written decision with reasons will be issued in due course. The hearing is now adjourned."

### **APPENDIX B Procedural outline for virtual contested hearing**

#### **PROCEDURE OUTLINE FOR HEARING TRIBUNAL CHAIR** FOR A CONTESTED HEARING PROCEEDING

#### AT THE COMMENCEMENT OF THE HEARING ON THE ALLEGATIONS

- 1. Facilitator/Chair to:
  - a. Make sure all participants are present;
  - b. Make sure everyone can hear and see the proceedings;
  - c. Ask all participants to mute their microphone when not speaking;
  - d. Clarify that recording or rebroadcasting of the hearing is not permitted;
  - e. Advise counsel that if they are referring to documents, they must ensure they refer the Hearing Tribunal to the correct document and page number; and
  - f. Outline the procedure if the Hearing Tribunal members need to deliberate or if counsel and their client need a break to discuss an issue.

#### 2. Chair opens the hearing:

"This is a hearing of the Hearing Tribunal appointed under the [Act] to consider allegations of unprofessional conduct against [name of investigated person]."

3. Chair introduces everyone:

"I would ask all the parties present to introduce themselves for the record:

- I am [state name], Chair of the Hearing Tribunal ... "

[Chair to do a roll call of all participants and have them identify themselves and their roles]

4. Chair confirms no objections to the Hearing Tribunal or its jurisdiction:

"Are there any objections to the Hearing Tribunal members who will be hearing this case or the Hearing Tribunal's jurisdiction?"

[Both parties to confirm no objection or if objection, hear from both parties and then adjourn to decide if necessary]

5. Chair confirms entitlement to counsel (only required if the investigated person is unrepresented):

"[Name of investigated person], do you acknowledge that you have the right to be represented by legal counsel and have chosen to waive your right to have legal counsel present today."

6. Confirming the open hearing:

"The hearing is open to the public unless the Hearing Tribunal decides to hold the hearing or a part of the hearing in private pursuant to [cite section of the Act]. Are there any applications to hold the hearing or a part of the hearing in private?"

[If so, hear submissions from both parties and then adjourn to decide if necessary]

7. Chair advises on procedure:

- "The procedure for today will be as follows:
  - a. The parties will be asked whether there are any preliminary or jurisdictional issues to address.
  - b. Prosecuting counsel will enter the Notice of Hearing as an Exhibit and will be asked to make an opening statement. Counsel for the investigated person [or the investigated person] may choose to make an opening statement at this time, or may reserve the right to make an opening statement once prosecuting counsel has finished presenting their case.
  - c. Following the opening statements, prosecuting counsel will present their case and witnesses.
  - d. The procedure for questioning witnesses will be as follows. The party calling the witness will examine the witness. The other party will then have the right to ask questions of the witness in cross-examination. The party calling the witness may re-examine on new points raised in the cross-examination. The Hearing Tribunal may also have questions of the witnesses, but will try to reserve its questions until after questioning by the parties, unless a point needs clarification. The parties may ask further question of the witness if new points are raised by the Hearing Tribunal's questions.

- e. Once prosecuting counsel has presented all of his/her witnesses, the investigated person will have an opportunity to make an opening statement (if not already made) and will then present his/her case and witnesses. The same procedure for questioning witnesses will be followed.
- f. At the conclusion of the evidence, the parties will make submissions on the evidence and allegations in the hearing and whether the conduct constitutes unprofessional conduct.
- g. The Hearing Tribunal will only hear evidence and argument on penalty if it makes one or more findings of unprofessional conduct.

Are there any objections to this proposed procedure?"

[If so, hear submissions from both parties. Adjourn for the Hearing Tribunal to decide if necessary.]

8. Preliminary matters:

"Are there any preliminary matters or jurisdictional issues that need to be addressed?"

[If so, hear submissions from both parties and then adjourn to decide if necessary]

9. Entering the Notice of Hearing:

"[Name of prosecuting counsel], please enter the Notice of Hearing as the first Exhibit."

[Chair can read the Allegation(s) into the record or allow time for the Hearing Tribunal members to review the Allegation(s)]

10. Service of the Notice of Hearing:

"Are there any submissions with respect to the adequacy of service of the Notice of Hearing?"

[If so, hear submissions from both parties and then adjourn to decide if necessary.]

11. Prosecuting Counsel's Opening Statement:

"I would ask [name of prosecuting counsel] to proceed with your opening statement."

[The hearing can then be turned over to the prosecuting counsel to make opening submissions]

12. Investigated Person or his/her counsel's Opening Statement:

"[Name of counsel for the investigated person or investigated person], do you wish to make an opening statement at this time?"

[If so, hear the opening statement. If not, proceed with the prosecuting counsel's witnesses.]

13. Calling Witnesses (Prosecuting Counsel):

"[Name of prosecuting counsel] please call your first witness."

[Continue for all subsequent witnesses for prosecuting counsel]

14. Investigated Person's Case:

[If the Investigated person has not yet made an opening statement, Chair asks counsel for the investigated person or investigated person to proceed with the opening statement. If opening statement already made, proceed with the investigated person's witnesses.]

15. Calling Witnesses (Investigated Person):

"[Counsel for the investigated person or investigated person], please call your first witness."

[Continue for all subsequent witnesses for the investigated person]

16. Closing Submissions [After all evidence has been put in]:

"If that is the last witness, I would ask the parties to proceed with their closing submissions.

17. Prosecuting Counsel Closing Submissions:

[Prosecuting counsel] please proceed with your closing submissions."

18. Counsel for Investigated Person (or Investigated Person) Closing Submissions:

[Counsel for the investigated person or investigated person] please proceed with your closing submissions."

19. Prosecuting Counsel Reply Submissions:

#### [Prosecuting counsel], do you have any submissions in reply?

20. The Hearing Tribunal may ask clarification questions during the submissions but may wish to keep any substantive questions until the end of the parties' submissions. The Chair may wish to adjourn the hearing briefly to deliberate in-camera about any questions. If so, the Chair adjourns the hearing, the Hearing Tribunal members discuss any questions in-camera and the hearing is reconvened to allow the Hearing Tribunal members.

#### **II. AT THE CONCLUSION OF THE HEARING ON THE ALLEGATIONS**

21. Following Closing Submissions and Questions by the Hearing Tribunal

"The Hearing Tribunal will now adjourn in-camera to consider the materials and the submissions made by the parties. A written decision with reasons will be rendered and forwarded to the parties at a later date. The hearing is now adjourned."

#### <u>OR</u>

"The Hearing Tribunal will now adjourn to a separate break-out room [or separate conference call] to discuss whether there are any further questions and to deliberate. Please remain in the virtual hearing but pause your video and sound. The facilitator will email/text you to advise when the Hearing Tribunal is coming back in the plenary hearing room and then all parties should reconvene in the plenary hearing room."

[Note: A separate hearing on sanction is held only if the Hearing Tribunal makes one or more findings of unprofessional conduct.]

Copyright RMRF LLP 2020. All rights reserved.

### **APPENDIX C Procedural outline for virtual sanction hearing**

#### PROCEDURE OUTLINE FOR HEARING TRIBUNAL CHAIR FOR A HEARING ON SANCTIONS

#### AT THE COMMENCEMENT OF THE HEARING ON SANCTIONS

1. Facilitator/Chair to:

- a. Make sure all participants are present;
- b. Make sure everyone can hear and see the proceedings;
- c. Ask all participants to mute their microphone when not speaking;
- d. Clarify that recording or rebroadcasting of the hearing is not permitted;
- e. Advise counsel that if they are referring to documents, they must ensure they refer the Hearing Tribunal to the correct document and page number; and
- f. Outline the procedure if the Hearing Tribunal members need to deliberate or if counsel and their client need a break to discuss an issue.

2. Chair opens the hearing:

"This is a continuation of the hearing of the Hearing Tribunal appointed under the [Act]. In its decision dated [insert] the Hearing Tribunal found [name of investigated person] guilty of unprofessional conduct. We are present today to hear submissions on sanction."

3. Chair introduces everyone:

"I will ask all the parties present to introduce themselves again for the record: - I am [state name], Chair of the Hearing Tribunal ... "

[Chair to do a roll call of all participants and have them identify themselves and their roles]

4. Chair advises on procedure:

"The procedure for today will be as follows:

- a. The parties will be asked whether there are any preliminary or jurisdictional issues to address.
- b. Prosecuting counsel will present evidence (if any) with respect to sanction.
- c. Counsel for the investigated person [or the investigated person] will present evidence (if any) with respect to sanction.
- d. Prosecuting counsel will make submissions on sanction.
- e. Counsel for the investigated person [or the investigated person] will make submissions on sanction.
- f. Prosecuting counsel will have an opportunity to make submissions in reply.
- g. Are there any objections to this proposed procedure?"

Note: If there are witnesses, the procedure for questioning witnesses is the same as in the hearing on the allegations. The party calling the witness will examine the witness. The other party will then have the right to ask questions of the witness in cross-examination. The party calling the witness may re-examine on new points raised in the cross-examination. The Hearing Tribunal may also have questions of the witnesses, but will try to reserve its questions until after questioning by the parties, unless a point needs clarification. The parties may ask further question of the witness if new points are raised by the Hearing Tribunal's questions.

Note: There are often no witnesses called during the sanction hearing, in which case the Chair can omit steps 5 and 6 and proceed to the step 7.

5. Prosecuting Counsel's Evidence:

"[Prosecuting Counsel] please call your first witness."

Once all witnesses have given evidence, turn over to counsel for the investigated person (or investigated person).

6. Counsel for Investigated Person's (or Investigated Person's) Evidence:

"[Counsel for Investigated Person (or Investigated Person)] please call your first witness."

Once all witnesses have given evidence, then proceed to submissions on sanction.

7. Prosecuting Counsel Submissions on Sanction:

" [Prosecuting counsel] please proceed with your submissions on sanction."

8. Counsel for Investigated Person (or Investigated Person) Submissions on Sanction:

" [Counsel for the investigated person or investigated person] please proceed with your submissions on sanction."

- 9. Prosecuting Counsel Reply Submissions:
- " [Prosecuting counsel], do you have any submissions in reply?"

10. The Hearing Tribunal may ask clarification questions during the submissions but may wish to keep any substantive questions until the end of the parties' submissions. The Chair may wish to adjourn the hearing briefly to deliberate in-camera about any questions. If so, the Chair adjourns the hearing, the Hearing Tribunal members discuss any questions in-camera and the hearing is reconvened to allow the Hearing Tribunal members to ask any questions.

#### **II. AT THE CONCLUSION OF THE HEARING ON THE ALLEGATIONS**

11. Following Submissions on Sanction and Questions by the Hearing Tribunal

"The Hearing Tribunal will now adjourn in-camera to consider the submissions made by the parties. A written decision with reasons will be rendered and forwarded to the parties at a later date. The hearing is now adjourned."

"The Hearing Tribunal will now adjourn to a separate break-out room [or separate conference call] to discuss whether there are any further questions and to deliberate. Please remain in the virtual hearing but pause your video and sound. The facilitator will email/text you to advise when the Hearing Tribunal is coming back in the plenary hearing room and then all parties should reconvene in the plenary hearing room."

Copyright RMRF LLP 2020. All rights reserved.

### **APPENDIX D Chair Instructions for Witnesses**

#### **HEARING TRIBUNAL CHAIR DIRECTIONS TO A WITNESS**

**Note:** This is a lengthy list and not all items will be required in each case. The Chair can decide what is needed depending on the circumstances.

#### I. AFTER THE WITNESS HAS BEEN SWORN IN

- 1. Please show the camera a copy of a piece of government issued photo identification.
- 2. Please position yourself in front of the camera so we can see your hands and adjust your lighting so we can clearly see your face.
- 3. It is important for the integrity of this process that this be your own evidence, given in response to

questions from counsel, without prompting by way of a person in the room or by way of notes, texts or email messages. Do you understand?

- 4. Is there is anyone else in the room with you?
- 5. Can you communicate with anyone outside your space during your testimony?
- 6. Do you have any communication tools open on your computer? (e.g. email, telephone, cellphone, etc.)
- 7. Please exit any programs on your computer or tablet except the one you are using to communicate with the hearing. Make sure all notifications are turned off on your computer, cellphone and other devices.
- 8. Do you have any smart speaker devices, such as Alexa, in the room with you?
- 9. Can you tell me what is in front of you?
- 10. Do you have any electronic or paper notes?
- 11. Are you recording this hearing?

12. Please move the camera to show the Hearing Tribunal and hearing participants a 360 degree view of

- the space you are participating in.
- 13. Do you have any devices with the ability to communicate?
- 14. Please place your cellphone and any other communicating device where everyone participating in the hearing can see it.
- 15. As much as possible, please make sure your hands are visible to the camera.
- 16. Are you willing to sign and be bound by the undertaking provided to you?
- 17. From time to time, counsel may be referring you to documents on the screen. [Instructions on how to use whichever document sharing program has been selected]

### **APPENDIX E Tips for witnesses**

#### **TIPS FOR WITNESSES**

#### **Preparing for a Hearing**

- 1. The person who will be questioning you may want to do a "dry run" to make sure everything works on your end.
- 2. Make sure you have a working camera, microphone, and speakers in advance of the hearing. If you are using a laptop or tablet device, it likely has these built in. If you are using a desk-top computer, you may need to acquire a camera, microphone and speakers to be able to participate.
- 3. You may need an extra monitor to view documents.
- 4. Clear your calendar for the duration of the time you are expected to be needed. If you have children or pets who may interrupt, do your best to make sure their needs are met by others during the time you are expected

to attend the hearing.

5. Identify and raise any concerns or problems as early as possible.

#### **Before the Hearing**

- 1. Dress as you normally would to appear at a hearing.
- 2. Make sure you have a quiet, private space that will be available for the duration of your participation in the hearing.
- 3. Make sure your internet connection is stable and minimize other usage for the duration of your participation in the hearing. Wifi will work, but hardwired is better.
- 4. Exit any programs on your computer or tablet except the one you will use to communicate with the hearing. Make sure all notifications are turned off on your computer, cellphone, and other devices.
- 5. If you wish to swear an oath using a religious text, make sure to have a copy available, as no-one will be able to give you one.

#### **During the Hearing**

- 1. Once you join the virtual platform, you may need a password to enter and you will likely need to be admitted to the hearing, which may take a few minutes.
- 2. Face the camera with your full face in the screen. You may be asked to sit so that your hands can be seen while you testify.
- 3. Expect to be asked if there is anyone else in the room with you.
- 4. Expect to be asked to show the Hearing Tribunal and hearing participants a 360 degree view of your space.
- 5. Expect to be asked to put your cellphone in place where everyone participating in the hearing can see it.
- 6. Do not speak over other participants. Wait until you are certain the other person has stopped speaking before you answer a question.

### **APPENDIX F Chart comparing in-person hearings to virtual hearings**



Access

Accessibility

Anyone can attend, so long as they can get to the venue where the hearing is held

Anyone can attend, so long as they have internet access and devices to meet their needs

VIRTUAL

May be more accessible to some groups and less to others (for example, even people without internet can attend, but people without transportation cannot)

Most other accessibility issues, such as

May be more accessible to some groups and less to others (for example, people in other countries or remote locations will be able to attend, but people without internet access will not be able to)

	Most other accessibility issues, such as hearing or seeing difficulties can be addressed with technology	Most other accessibility issues, such as hearing or seeing difficulties can be addressed with technology
Efficiency	Generally relatively efficient	Generally relatively efficient once parties get "into the flow"
Expenses	More costly – food, hotels, transportation, hearing venues, parking, printing, etc. More expensive for hosts and participants	Much less expensive – cost of virtual hearing platform, mailing Less expensive for hosts and participants
Interruptions	Less likely, although uncontrollable elements can still interrupt	Much more likely, and much less easily controlled. In addition to technological interruptions, because the hearing is taking place in multiple locations, many of which are unlikely to be routinely reserved for hearings, the likelihood of an interruption is dramatically increased
Logistics	More familiar to most people. Easier to envision in advance and to plan for Traditional methods for submitting exhibits	More difficult for some people to navigate. More difficult, at least initially, to plan for the unexpected Plans need to be in place for how to submit exhibits, exhibit stamping etc.

Natural Justice	Easier to be aware of and to address issues of natural justice immediately	Some concerns that natural justice will be harder to address. For example, if someone cannot be heard, how will other participants know that the person is trying to make themselves heard?
Resources	Much more paper, potentially less energy usage, although many people bring devices with them to in-person hearings as well	Much less paper, potentially more energy usage
Security/ Confidentiality	Easier to regulate attendance and to see if people are doing things they are not supposed to, but always subject to the honour of the participants	More difficult to secure. Always subject to the honour of the participants
Technology	Much less technology and technological knowledge required. Where there are technological needs, others are present to help address	All participants will require certain technology and certain technological knowledge in order to participate

### APPENDIX G Undertaking of regulated member of the profession attending the hearing

#### UNDERTAKING AND AGREEMENT OF REGULATED MEMBER

### HEARING OF THE HEARING TRIBUNAL OF THE [INSERT NAME OF COLLEGE]

<u>Hearing into a complaint against:</u>

<u>Hearing Date:</u>

I am regulated member of the *[name of College]*. I understand that the hearing in the above noted matter will proceed virtually. I further understand that in accordance with section *[insert]* of the *[insert]* Act], the hearing is open to the public. I can attend or participate in this hearing by audioconference or videoconference.

To protect the integrity of these proceedings, I undertake and agree not to record or rebroadcast in any manner the proceedings. I acknowledge that if I breach this undertaking and agreement, I may be subject to discipline by the *[insert name of College]*.

**Print Name** 

Signature

Date

Status: party/witness/observer

Name of Lawyer, if any

opendix

### **APPENDIX H** Undertaking of member of the public attending the hearing

#### **UNDERTAKING AND AGREEMENT**

#### <u>HEARING OF THE HEARING TRIBUNAL OF THE [INSERT NAME OF COLLEGE]</u>

<u>Hearing into a complaint against:</u>

**Hearing Date:** 

I understand that the hearing in the above noted matter will proceed virtually. I further understand that in accordance with section [insert] of the [insert Act], the hearing is open to the public. I can attend this hearing by audioconference or videoconference.

To protect the integrity of these proceedings, I undertake and agree not to record or rebroadcast in any manner the proceedings. I acknowledge that if I breach this undertaking and agreement, I may be prohibited from further participation in the proceedings.

**Print Name** 

Signature

Address

Name of Lawyer, if any

Email address

Phone number





### WWW.RMRF.COM

Reynolds Mirth Richards & Farmer LLP is an Edmonton based law firm with a proud history of serving clients locally, nationally and internationally.